



CITY OF ATLANTA

KASIM REED
MAYOR

DEPARTMENT OF CITY PLANNING
55 TRINITY AVENUE, S.W. SUITE 3350 – ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303-0308
404-330-6145 – FAX: 404-658-7491
www.atlantaga.gov

TIM KEANE
Commissioner

OFFICE OF DESIGN

STAFF REPORT May 24, 2017

Agenda Item: Application for a Type III Certificate of Appropriateness (CA3-17-205) for an addition and site work at **603 Boulevard**. Property is zoned R-5 / Grant Park Historic District (Subarea 1).

Applicant: Philippe Pellerin
603 Boulevard Se

Facts: This existing single family structure was constructed in 1908 and is considered contributing to the District.

Analysis: The following code sections apply to this application:

Sec. 16-20K.006. - General regulations.

The following general regulations shall apply to all properties located within the Grant Park Historic District.

(2) *Certificates of Appropriateness.*

(C) Type III Certificates of Appropriateness shall be required for:

2. All major alterations and additions to existing structure, with respect to any façade that faces a public street.

(1) *Development Controls.*

(A) *Front Yards:* Front yard setbacks shall either: i) conform to the setback of the previously existing contributing building of like use; or ii) shall be no closer to the street than the closest and no farther from the street than the farthest contributing structure of like use on that side of the block.

(B) *Side Yards:* Side yards shall either: i) conform to the setback of the previously existing contributing building of like use; ii) conform to the setback of the existing building; iii) conform to any existing pattern of unequal side yard setbacks previously established by a majority of the contributing buildings of like use on that side of the block; or iv) be of a width of not less than seven feet.

(C) *Rear Yard:* Rear yard setback shall be seven feet.

(D) *Off-street parking and driveway requirements:*

1. Off-street parking shall not be permitted in the front yard or half-depth front yard.

2. The commission shall have the authority to vary section 28.006(10) relative to the requirement for an independent driveway connected to a public street.

3. If constructed, independent driveways within the front yard or half-depth front yard shall be a maximum of ten feet wide and shall have a maximum curb cut of ten feet, exclusive of the flare.

(2) *Architectural Standards.*

(A) *Statement of Intent.* The purpose of these regulations is to set forth basic, minimum standards of architectural design and construction that are compatible with and complementary to the existing historic residences within the neighborhood, as the cumulative historic diversity of the built environment is a defining characteristic of this neighborhood. It is not the intent of these regulations to limit the design of

new housing to replication of styles of existing structures, but to foster residential design that, with regard to massing, size, scale, materials, and architectural elements, enhances the architectural quality of the neighborhood and simultaneously encourages creativity. Additionally, these regulations are intended to integrate the physical characteristics of new construction into the existing neighborhood in a meaningful way so as to restore and promote the public health, safety, and welfare of this neighborhood.

The following residential architectural styles currently predominate in the neighborhood and contribute to its unique historic character; they are included here for reference only: American Four Square, Craftsman, English Vernacular Revival, Folk Victorian, Queen Anne, and Shotgun.

(B) *Design Standards and Criteria for New Principal Structures.*

1. Identified design elements of size, scale, massing and materials of new construction shall be substantially consistent with said identified design elements found in contributing structures of like use in the district as listed in subsection 16-20K.007(15)(c.).
2. A paved walkway from the front sidewalk to the front entry of the principal structure shall be provided.
3. Front porches on the principal structure shall be required and shall be a minimum of one-third the width of the front façade and a minimum of seven feet in depth. Side porches shall be a minimum of four feet in depth. Porches may be enclosed by screen wire only, provided all the main features of a porch are maintained in place and the screening materials can be removed at a future date with minimal damage to said features.
4. All front façades and front porches of the principal structure shall face and be parallel to the lot frontage. Wrap around front porches are permitted.
5. Roof form above the front façade of the principal structure shall be gabled and/or hipped. Roof pitch shall be a minimum of 6 in 12. Roof pitch above porches shall not be restricted.
6. The height of the principal structure shall not exceed 35 feet. (See section 16-28.022 for excluded portions of structures.)
7. The first floor of the principal structure shall be on foundations and elevated above the grade a minimum of two entrance step risers each of which shall be no less than six inches in height. All front steps shall have closed risers and closed ends. Access ramps shall be permitted.
8. Garages entrances are prohibited on the front façade. Single car-width garage entrances are permitted on the half depth front yard façade of the structure. Double car-width garage entrances are permitted at the rear of the structure.
9. Decks, Balconies and Upper Level Terraces:
 - a. Decks shall be permitted only when located to the rear of the principal structure.
 - b. Decks shall be permitted at any level.
 - c. Balconies and upper level terraces shall be permitted.
10. Any portion of a chimney that is located on any façade that faces a public street shall originate at grade.
11. Any façades that face a public street shall consist of fenestration that is either: 1) substantially consistent with fenestration on contributing structures of like use in the district, or 2) shall be no less than 15 percent and no greater than 40 percent of the total surface wall area. Windows may be individual or grouped. No individual window unit shall exceed 28 square feet. Within each individual window unit, no individual window sash, either fixed or operable, shall exceed 16 square feet.
12. When practical, skylights should be located where least visible from the public street. If skylights are visible from the public street, the glass shall be tinted to match the surrounding roof area. Protruding "bubble" skylights are prohibited.
13. Accessory structures, such as carriage houses, smoke houses, tenant and alley houses, private garages, carports, electric vehicle charging stations equipped with Level 1 and/or Level 2 EVSE, and mechanical equipment shall be located to the side and/or rear of the principal structure within the buildable area of the lot and shall not project beyond the front of the principal structure. If mechanical equipment is visible from a public street, screening with appropriate plant or fence materials is required.
14. Fences and walls, adjacent to a public street upon completion, shall be subject to the provisions of section 16-28.005(5) and the following limitations:
 - a. Fences not exceeding four feet in height may be erected in a front yard. Other than retaining walls, walls shall not be erected in a front yard or a half-depth front yard.

- b. Fences and walls not exceeding six feet in height may be erected in the side or rear yards.
 - c. In a half-depth front yard, when a fence exceeds four feet in height, the standard zoning requirements for a variance are in effect. Where no sidewalk exists, the fence shall be set back three feet from a public street. Portions of retaining walls facing a public street and located in a required front yard or half-depth front yard shall be faced with brick, stone or masonry wall covered with a parge coat of stucco, such as Portland stucco cement.
 - d. The finish side or front side of one-sided fences shall face the public street.
15. On those façades of any structure that face a public street, the following regulations on building materials shall apply. Alternate materials may be submitted for review by the commission.
- a. Paving materials for walks and drives: Black asphalt is prohibited.
 - b. Visible foundation materials: Foundations shall constitute a distinct building design element and shall contrast with the front façade siding material. Brick, stone, concrete, stucco, and architectural concrete masonry units (C.M.U.) shall be permitted. Standard, unfinished concrete block and stacked stone is prohibited.
 - c. Siding/veneer: Horizontal lap siding, vinyl siding, aluminum siding, shingles, brick, hard stucco, and stone shall be permitted. Stacked stone is prohibited.
 - d. Roofing: Asphalt shingles, wood shingles, metal shingles, slate, and pre-finished metal panels shall be permitted.
 - e. Chimneys: Brick, stone, or architectural concrete masonry units (C.M.U.) shall be permitted. Siding is prohibited.
 - f. Fences: Brick, stone, wire mesh, architectural C.M.U., or vertical pickets made of ornamental metal, wood or simulated wood shall be permitted in the front yard and half depth front yard.
- (D) *Design Criteria for Alterations and Additions to Contributing Structures.* Alterations and additions to contributing structures requiring a Certificate of Appropriateness shall comply with one of the following provided that the mere increase in floor area otherwise authorized in the district shall not constitute a standard for review:
- 1. Alterations and additions shall be consistent with and reinforce the historic architectural character of the entire existing contributing structure and shall comply with the applicable regulations for new construction set forth in subsection 16-20K.007(2)(B) above; or
 - 2. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work may differentiate from the old. To protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment, any new work will be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features of the property and environment.

The Applicant is proposing the addition of a new accessory structure to the site which will be connected to the main structure via a breezeway. Staff would note that while the breezeway in question will not be attached to the structure and will in-fact be separated no less than 6” from the existing side façade, the work would amount to an addition due to the scale of the accessory structure and the appearance of the new structure being attached to the house. As such, Staff will review the project using the regulations for additions to contributing structures.

The District regulations allow for two criteria when reviewing additions to a contributing structure. The first states that additions shall be consistent with and reinforce the historic architectural character of the entire existing contributing structure and shall comply with the applicable regulations for new construction. The second states that the addition shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property, that the new work may differentiate from the old, and any new work be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features of the property and environment. Staff finds that both criteria would be appropriate for use on this project, and that the addition would meet either set of criteria, but will use the second of the two criteria in the discussion of the project.

The proposed accessory structure amounts to a diminutive interpretation of the principal structure. The architectural details are diminished and simplified when compared to their corresponding features on the principal structure. The massing of the structure towards the side and rear of the principal structure will allow the accessory structure to have a reduced visual impact on the public right of way and to be clearly the secondary structure on the site when compared to the size and prominence of the principal structure.

CA3-17-205

Staff Recommendations: Based upon the following:

- 1) The plans meet the regulations, per Section 16-20K.007;

Staff recommends Approval of an Application for a Type III Certificate of Appropriateness (CA3-17-205) for an addition and site work at **603 Boulevard Se.**



KASIM REED
MAYOR

CITY OF ATLANTA

DEPARTMENT OF CITY PLANNING
55 TRINITY AVENUE, S.W. SUITE 3350 – ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303
404-330-6145 – FAX: 404-658-7491
<http://www.atlantaga.gov/Government/Planning.aspx>

TIM KEANE
COMMISSIONER

OFFICE OF DESIGN

STAFF REPORT

May 24, 2017

Agenda Item: Application for a Type III Certificate of Appropriateness (CA3-17-212) for alterations and a second story front gable addition at **1085 White Oak Avenue** - - Property is zoned R-4/Oakland City Historic District / Beltline.

Applicant: Victor Barahona
413 Central Line, Stockbridge

Facts: According to the Oakland City Historic District inventory sheet, the English Vernacular Revival house was built in 1940 and it's contributing to the District. As can be seen in the inventory sheet photograph, the house appears to have had very few alterations since its construction though at least since 2007 a rear addition was built. The 2008 update photograph shows the same house, though a new roof has been put on and additional deterioration of the house has occurred. The District regulations cover exterior changes that are visible from a public street.

Recently, work was completed on the house without a building permit or certificate of appropriateness, including:

- Removal of the prominent front chimney;
- Creation of a front facing gable in place of the side-to-side smaller gable;
- Creation of a front facing gable behind the other new gable over the area of the previous addition;
- Removal of all the siding, windows, architectural elements, and exterior trim; and
- Potentially changes in the window location, size, and number.

In the plans submitted with the application, all of the above work is proposed, including the resizing and relocation of the windows on the front façade. No side elevations were included in the submission.

Analysis: The following code sections apply to this application:

Section 16-20M.005. Compatibility Rule

The intent of the Mayor and Council in establishing the regulations of the Oakland City Historic District is to ensure that all work requiring a Certificate of Appropriateness is compatible with the historic design, scale, and general character of the entire district and of the contributing structures in the immediately adjacent environment of a particular block face. To further that intent and simultaneously permit flexibility in design, the regulations provide a Compatibility Rule which is as follows: Where quantifiable (i.e. building height, setback, etc.), the element or building characteristic in question shall be no less than the smallest such element or building characteristic of buildings or site layouts in that block face that characterizes such like contributing buildings and shall be internally consistent with the historic design of the structure and shall be no greater than the greatest such element or building characteristic of buildings or site layouts in that block face that characterizes such like contributing buildings or site layouts and shall be internally consistent with the historic design of the structure. Where not quantifiable (roof form, architectural trim, etc.), the element or building characteristic in question shall be compatible with that which predominates in such like contributing structures on that block face and shall be internally consistent with the historic design of the structure.

Section 16-20M.007. Certificates of Appropriateness.

(3) Type III certificates of appropriateness shall be required for:

- (b) All major alterations and additions to an existing structure, when the alterations or additions are visible from a public street.

Sec. 16-20M.012. - Development controls.

- (1) Front yards: Front yard setbacks shall either: i) conform to the setback of the previously existing contributing building of like use; or ii) comply with the compatibility rule.
- (2) Side yards: Side yards shall either: i) conform to the setback of the previously existing contributing building of like use; ii) conform to the setback of the existing building; iii) conform to any existing pattern of unequal side yard setbacks previously established by a majority of the contributing buildings of like use on that side of the block; or iv) be of a width of not less than seven feet.
- (3) Rear yard: Rear yard setback shall be seven feet.

Section 16-20M.013. Architectural Standards.

(1) Statement of Intent.

The purpose of these regulations is to set forth basic, minimum standards of architectural design and construction that are compatible with and complementary to the existing historic residences within the neighborhood, as the cumulative historic diversity of the built environment is a defining characteristic of this neighborhood. It is not the intent of these regulations to limit the design of new housing to replication of styles of existing structures, but to foster residential design that, with regard to massing, size, scale, materials, and architectural elements, enhances the architectural quality of the neighborhood and simultaneously encourages creativity. Additionally, these regulations are intended to integrate the physical characteristics of new construction into the existing neighborhood in a meaningful way so as to restore and promote the public health, safety, and welfare of this neighborhood.

The following residential architectural styles currently predominate in the neighborhood and contribute to its unique historic character; they are included here for reference only: American Four Square, Craftsman, English Vernacular Revival, Folk Victorian, Queen Anne, and Minimal Traditional Cottages.

(2) Design Standards and Criteria for New Principal Structures.

- (e) All front façades, front porches, and front doors of the principal structure shall face and be parallel to the street, except in those blocks in which the historic pattern is such that houses are situated at an angle to the street, in which case the compatibility rule shall apply.
- (f) The compatibility rule shall apply to the form and pitch of the primary roof of the primary structure.
- (g) The compatibility rule shall apply to the height, scale, and massing of the principal structure. In no case shall the height of a structure exceed 35 feet.
- (h) The maximum height of the first floor of the front façade above grade shall be subject to the compatibility rule. At a minimum, the first floor of the principal structure shall be on foundations and shall be elevated above grade at the front façade a minimum of two entrance risers each of which shall not be less than seven inches in height. Slab-on-grade construction is not permitted.
- (i) The compatibility rule shall apply to the design and size of front porches, and the placement and orientation of front steps. Front porches shall contain roofs, balustrades, columns, steps, and other features as determined by the compatibility rule. Front porches may extend up to ten feet into the required front yard. All front porch steps shall have closed risers and ends.
- (k) The use of chimneys with new principal structures is encouraged. When any portion of a chimney is visible from a public street as a façade element, the chimney shall originate at grade.
- (n) Fenestration, if visible from a public street upon completion, shall meet the following requirements:
1. Windows in the front façade shall be predominantly vertical in proportion.
 2. If muntins or mullions are used, such muntins or mullions shall be either true divided lights or simulated divided lights with muntins integral to the sash and permanently affixed to the exterior face of glass.
- (o) Window and door casing widths and depths:
1. Replacement windows units shall maintain the size and shape of the original window opening.
 2. The compatibility rule shall apply to the following aspects of fenestration:
 - a. The size and shape of individual window openings.
 - b. The overall pattern of fenestration as it relates to the building façade.
 - c. The style of the individual window.
- (p) Mechanical and communication equipment shall be located to the side or rear of the principal structure and in the location least visible from a public street. Screening with appropriate plant material or fencing is required if the equipment is visible from a public street.
- (q) Subject to the compatibility rule, wood or smooth-finish cementitious lap siding, wood shingles, brick, stone, and true stucco are permissible building materials for the façades of the principal structure. Corrugated metal, aluminum siding, and vinyl siding are not permitted.
- (r) In addition to all other applicable regulations, the compatibility rule shall apply to the following building materials and design elements, if visible from a public street upon completion:

1. The dimensions of the exposed face of lap siding and wood shingles.
2. The type of brick and pattern of brickwork.
3. The type of stone and pattern of stonework.
4. The material and texture of stucco.
5. The size and type of exterior doors. Notwithstanding the compatibility rule, exterior doors shall be wood panel or fixed glass panel in wood frame.
6. The materials and pattern of roofing.
7. Gables and gable returns.
8. Dormers
9. Paving materials for walks and drives.
10. Above-grade foundation materials. Notwithstanding the compatibility rule, foundations shall constitute a distinct building design element and shall contrast with the primary façade's exterior material and exposed concrete or concrete masonry unit (CMU) foundation walls are prohibited as a finished surface.
11. Exterior portions of chimneys. Notwithstanding the compatibility rule, chimneys shall be faced with masonry and siding on chimneys is not permitted.

Section 16-20M.017. Design Criteria for Alterations and Additions to Contributing Structures.

(1) Alterations and additions to contributing structures requiring a Certificate of Appropriateness shall comply with one of the following:

- (a) Alterations and additions shall be consistent with and reinforce the historic architectural character of the entire existing contributing structure and shall comply with the applicable regulations set forth in subsection 16-20M.013 (2) above; or
- (b) Alterations and additions shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new building elements and materials may differentiate from the old. To protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment, the compatibility rule shall apply to any new work regarding the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the property and environment.

Sec. 16-20.009. Same; further standards.

- (1) Every reasonable effort shall be made to adapt the property in a manner which requires minimal alteration of the building, structure or site and its environment.
- (2) The distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure or site and its environment shall not be destroyed. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.
- (3) Changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right, and this significance shall be recognized and respected.
- (4) Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure, object or site shall be kept where possible.
- (5) Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should reflect the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historical, physical, or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures.
- (6) Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural or cultural material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property, neighborhood or environment.
- (7) Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to buildings, structures or sites shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building, structure or site would be unimpaired.

Assessment of Submitted Documentation

In the submission, only basic proposed front and rear elevations were submitted. No side elevations were included or existing condition plans were included. Further, many of the details of the proposed design usually included in such plans were missing from the plans, such as the crawl space foundation, front stairs, trim and ornamentation details, all materials, etc. The Staff would recommend that the Applicant provide a set of complete, to-scale, and accurate existing and proposed detailed elevations that include all exterior materials, trim, and architectural components shown and labeled. Without this additional information and detail, the Staff cannot perform a complete review of the proposed project.

Overall Design Assessment

Notwithstanding the lack of documentation noted above, the Staff finds that the un-permitted work that has occurred at the property and what will occur at the property does not meet either standard for alterations or additions to a contributing building. Regarding the first standard, the alterations and additions are not consistent with and do not reinforce the historic architectural character of the entire existing contributing structure given they include removal of the character defining chimney, substantial changes in the roof form, relocation and resizing of the windows, and complete removal of all historic and/or original exterior materials. Regarding the second standard, the alterations and additions destroy significant amounts of substantial historic materials that characterize the property. There is and would be very little, if any, of the historic material left from the house if the project were completed as proposed.

Given the loss of historic materials (exterior trim, chimney, siding, windows, doors, architectural elements, etc.), the Staff finds that second standard cannot be met, even in the future. That leaves the first standard, which might be able to be met in the future, if there are substantial and wholesale changes are made to the proposed design. This would have to include at least returning the roof form, window locations, and front chimney of the house back to the condition, design, location, etc. before the project started. Further revisions to the proposed plan might be needed as well, depending on how these initial revisions would impact the overall design, proportions, etc.

The Staff would recommend the previously completed exterior work be undone to the maximum extent possible and the proposed design substantially and completely revised to closely reflect the configuration, massing, and architectural elements of the house prior to the initiation of the un-permitted work.

Staff Recommendation: Based upon the following:

1. The proposed project is not consistent with and does not reinforce the historic architectural character of the entire existing contributing structure, per Section 16-20M.017(1)(a);
2. The proposed project destroys historic materials that characterize the property, per Section 16-20M.017(1)(b).

The Staff would recommend deferral of an application for a Type III Certificate of Appropriateness (CA3-17-212) for alterations and a second story front gable addition at **1085 White Oak Avenue** - - Property is zoned R-4/Oakland City Historic District / Beltline to allow time for the Applicant to address the following concerns and comments:

1. The Applicant shall provide a set of complete, to-scale, and accurate existing and proposed detailed elevations that include all exterior materials, trim, and architectural components shown and labeled, per Section 16-20M;
2. The previously completed exterior work shall be undone to the maximum extent possible and the proposed design substantially and completely revised to closely reflect the configuration, massing, and architectural elements of the house prior to the initiation of the un-permitted work, per Section 16-20M; and
3. The Applicant shall submit any revised plans and supporting materials (including all required copies) at least eight (8) days prior to the Commission meeting to which the application is deferred.



CITY OF ATLANTA

KASIM REED
MAYOR

DEPARTMENT OF CITY PLANNING
55 TRINITY AVENUE, S.W. SUITE 3350 – ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303-0308
404-330-6145 – FAX: 404-658-7491
www.atlantaga.gov

TIM KEANE
Commissioner

OFFICE OF DESIGN

STAFF REPORT May 24, 2017

Agenda Item: Application for a Type III Certificate of Appropriateness (CA3-17-213) for a new single family home at **1015 Lawton Ave Sw**. Property is zoned R-4A / Oakland City Historic District / Beltline.

Applicant: Rosemary Kernahan
824 Memorial Dr.

Facts: This lot is currently vacant.

Analysis: The following code sections apply to this application:

Sec. 16-20M.005. - Compatibility rule.

The intent of the mayor and council in establishing the regulations of the Oakland City Historic District is to ensure that all work requiring a certificate of appropriateness is compatible with the historic design, scale, and general character of the entire district and of the contributing structures in the immediately adjacent environment of a particular block face. To further that intent and simultaneously permit flexibility in design, the regulations provide a compatibility rule which is as follows: Where quantifiable (i.e. building height, setback, etc.), the element or building characteristic in question shall be no less than the smallest such element or building characteristic of buildings or site layouts in that block face that characterizes such like contributing buildings and shall be internally consistent with the historic design of the structure and shall be no greater than the greatest such element or building characteristic of buildings or site layouts in that block face that characterizes such like contributing buildings or site layouts and shall be internally consistent with the historic design of the structure. Where not quantifiable (roof form, architectural trim, etc.), the element or building characteristic in question shall be compatible with that which predominates in such like contributing structures on that block face and shall be internally consistent with the historic design of the structure.

Sec. 16-20M.007. - Certificates of appropriateness.

(3) Type III certificates of appropriateness shall be required for:

(a) Construction of all new principal structures;

Sec. 16-20M.012. - Development controls.

- (1) *Front yards:* Front yard setbacks shall either: i) conform to the setback of the previously existing contributing building of like use; or ii) comply with the compatibility rule.
- (2) *Side yards:* Side yards shall either: i) conform to the setback of the previously existing contributing building of like use; ii) conform to the setback of the existing building; iii) conform to any existing pattern of unequal side yard setbacks previously established by a majority of the contributing buildings of like use on that side of the block; or iv) be of a width of not less than seven feet.
- (3) *Rear yard:* Rear yard setback shall be seven feet.
- (4) *Off-street parking and driveway requirements:*

- (a) Off-street parking shall not be permitted in the front yard or half-depth front yard.
 - (b) The commission shall have the authority to vary section 28.006(10) relative to the requirement for an independent driveway connected to a public street.
 - (c) If constructed, independent driveways within the front yard or half-depth front yard shall be a maximum of ten feet wide and shall have a maximum curb cut of ten feet, exclusive of the flare.
 - (d) The compatibility rule shall apply to the construction of side-by-side driveways and, if permitted, the design thereof.
- (5) Floor area ratio shall not exceed 0.50.
- Sec. 16-20M.013. - Architectural standards.

- (1) *Statement of intent.* The purpose of these regulations is to set forth basic, minimum standards of architectural design and construction that are compatible with and complementary to the existing historic residences within the neighborhood, as the cumulative historic diversity of the built environment is a defining characteristic of this neighborhood. It is not the intent of these regulations to limit the design of new housing to replication of styles of existing structures, but to foster residential design that, with regard to massing, size, scale, materials, and architectural elements, enhances the architectural quality of the neighborhood and simultaneously encourages creativity. Additionally, these regulations are intended to integrate the physical characteristics of new construction into the existing neighborhood in a meaningful way so as to restore and promote the public health, safety, and welfare of this neighborhood.

The following residential architectural styles currently predominate in the neighborhood and contribute to its unique historic character; they are included here for reference only:

American Four Square, Craftsman, English Vernacular Revival, Folk Victorian, Queen Anne, and Minimal Traditional Cottages.

- (2) *Design standards and criteria for new principal structures.*
- (a) No individual house design shall substantially repeat a design of a new principal structure on the block face that was approved by the commission since the adoption of this district.
 - (b) An unpaved planting strip adjacent and parallel to the public street shall be provided. The compatibility rule shall apply to the dimensions and design of planting strips.
 - (c) A sidewalk between the planting strip and the required front yard and parallel to the public street shall be provided. The sidewalk shall be the same width as the sidewalk on abutting properties or it shall be the width otherwise required by city ordinance, whichever is greater. If no sidewalk exists in the block, the new sidewalk shall not be less than six-feet wide. The compatibility rule shall apply to sidewalks paving materials. If no sidewalk paving material predominates in the block, the sidewalk shall be constructed of the historically accurate material for that block, either hexagonal pavers, concrete inlaid with hexagonal imprint, or brick.
 - (d) A paved walkway from the front sidewalk to the front entry of the principal structure shall be provided.
 - (e) All front façades, front porches, and front doors of the principal structure shall face and be parallel to the street, except in those blocks in which the historic pattern is such that houses are situated at an angle to the street, in which case the compatibility rule shall apply.
 - (f) The compatibility rule shall apply to the form and pitch of the primary roof of the primary structure.
 - (g) The compatibility rule shall apply to the height, scale, and massing of the principal structure. In no case shall the height of a structure exceed 35 feet.
 - (h) The maximum height of the first floor of the front façade above grade shall be subject to the compatibility rule. At a minimum, the first floor of the principal structure shall be on foundations and shall be elevated above grade at the front façade a minimum of two entrance risers each of which shall not be less than seven inches in height. Slab-on-grade construction is not permitted.
 - (i) The compatibility rule shall apply to the design and size of front porches, and the placement and orientation of front steps. Front porches shall contain roofs, balustrades, columns, steps, and other features as determined by the compatibility rule. Front porches may extend up to ten feet into the required front yard. All front porch steps shall have closed risers and ends.
 - (j) Decks are permitted only when located to the rear of the principal structure and such decks shall be no wider than the width of the principal structure.
 - (n) Fenestration, if visible from a public street upon completion, shall meet the following requirements:
 - 1. Windows in the front façade shall be predominantly vertical in proportion.
 - 2. If muntins or mullions are used, such muntins or mullions shall be either true divided lights or simulated divided lights with muntins integral to the sash and permanently affixed to the exterior face of glass.

- (o) Window and door casing widths and depths:
 - 2. The compatibility rule shall apply to the following aspects of fenestration:
 - a. The size and shape of individual window openings.
 - b. The overall pattern of fenestration as it relates to the building façade.
 - c. The style of the individual window.
- (p) Mechanical and communication equipment shall be located to the side or rear of the principal structure and in the location least visible from a public street. Screening with appropriate plant material or fencing is required if the equipment is visible from a public street.
- (q) Subject to the compatibility rule, wood or smooth-finish cementitious lap siding, wood shingles, brick, stone, and true stucco are permissible building materials for the façades of the principal structure. Corrugated metal, aluminum siding, and vinyl siding are not permitted.
- (r) In addition to all other applicable regulations, the compatibility rule shall apply to the following building materials and design elements, if visible from a public street upon completion:
 - 1. The dimensions of the exposed face of lap siding and wood shingles.
 - 2. The type of brick and pattern of brickwork.
 - 3. The type of stone and pattern of stonework.
 - 4. The material and texture of stucco.
 - 5. The size and type of exterior doors. Notwithstanding the compatibility rule, exterior doors shall be wood panel or fixed glass panel in wood frame.
 - 6. The materials and pattern of roofing.
 - 7. Gables and gable returns.
 - 8. Dormers
 - 9. Paving materials for walks and drives.
 - 10. Above-grade foundation materials. Notwithstanding the compatibility rule, foundations shall constitute a distinct building design element and shall contrast with the primary façade's exterior material and exposed concrete or concrete masonry unit (CMU) foundation walls are prohibited as a finished surface.

The District regulations have quantitative and qualitative requirements for alterations and additions. If an item is not discussed below, Staff found the related regulations were met.

Site plan

The District regulations require a sidewalk to be provided along with a planting strip subject to the Compatibility rule with regards to its width. The plans show the existing sidewalk being retained, but the photographs of the property show the sidewalk to be in a state of disrepair. Based on this information Staff finds it is likely that the sidewalk would be replaced or repaired. Staff recommends the Applicant clarify whether the existing sidewalk will be replaced or repaired. If replacement of the sidewalk is proposed, Staff recommends the sidewalk be replaced in-kind with regards to materials, width, and that the planting strip be maintained.

New structure

The dimensions of siding are subject to the compatibility rule. Staff recommends the Applicant provide information showing the proposed siding dimensions meet the compatibility rule.

In looking at the contributing structures on the block face, Staff finds the majority of the structures contain a full width front porch. The District regulations require the size of front porches to meet the compatibility rule. As such, Staff recommends the front porch be a full width front porch.

CA3-17-213

Staff Recommendations: Based upon the following:

- 1) The plans meet the regulations, per Section 16-20M.012, with the exceptions of the comments noted above;

Staff recommends Approval of an Application for a Type III Certificate of Appropriateness (CA3-17-213) for a new single family home at **1015 Lawton Ave Sw.**, to allow the Applicant time to address the following Staff concerns:

1. The sidewalk shall be replaced in-kind with regards to materials, width, and the planting strip shall be maintained, Per Sec. 16-20M.013(2)(c);
2. The Applicant shall provide information showing the proposed siding dimensions meet the compatibility rule, per Sec. 16-20M.013(2)(r)(1);
3. The front porch shall be a full width front porch, per Sec. 16-20M.013(2)(i); and,
4. Staff shall review and if appropriate, approve the final plans and documentation.



CITY OF ATLANTA

KASIM REED
MAYOR

DEPARTMENT OF CITY PLANNING
55 TRINITY AVENUE, S.W. SUITE 3350 – ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303-0308
404-330-6145 – FAX: 404-658-7491
www.atlantaga.gov

TIM KEANE
Commissioner

OFFICE OF DESIGN

STAFF REPORT May 24, 2017

Agenda Item: Application for Type II Certificate of Appropriateness (CA2-17-214) for alterations at **674 Peeples Street** - Property is zoned R-4A/West End Historic District / Beltline.

Applicant: Caleb Racicot
674 Peeples Street

Facts: According to the District inventory sheet, this dwelling was constructed between 1890 and 1900 and is contributing to the District.

At this time, the Applicant is proposing the following components to their project:

1. Remove the asbestos siding and abate any lead paint;
2. If necessary, remove for reinstallation the original siding to complete any structural repairs / replacement to the framing under the original siding;
3. If necessary, complete structural repairs / replacement of framing;
4. Reinstall original siding and replace in-kind any damaged, missing, or deteriorated pieces;
5. Repaint the house; and
6. Replace the non-original front porch railing with a historically compatible railing.

Analysis: The following code sections apply to this application:

Per Section 16-20G.005 of the Atlanta Land Development Code, as amended:

The following general regulations shall apply to the West End Historic District.

- (1) Certificates of Appropriateness: Certificates of appropriateness within this district shall be required as follows:
 - (a) When required:
 - (i) To change the exterior appearance of any portion of a structure within the district, when said change can be seen from the public right-of-way;
 - (b) Type required:
 - (v) The following Type II Certificates of Appropriateness shall be review by the commission and shall be required for any of the following to the extent they are visible from a public street:
 - a. Alterations to any façade of any principal structure; and
- (2) The Compatibility Rule: The compatibility rule is a method of ensuring that alterations to existing structures and the design of proposed new construction are sensitive to and sympathetic toward existing elements of design, proportions, scale, massing, materials, and general character of the contributing buildings in the immediately adjacent environment of the block face. To permit flexibility, many regulations are made subject to the compatibility rule, which states: "The elements in question (roof form, architectural trim, etc.) shall match that which predominates on the contributing buildings of the same block face, or where quantifiable (i.e., buildings height and width as measured at front façade, floor height, lot dimensions, etc.), shall be no smaller than the smallest or larger than the largest such dimension of the

contributing buildings of the same block face." Those elements to which the compatibility rule applies are specified in these regulations by reference to "compatibility rule."

Sec. 16-20G.006. - Specific regulations.

In addition to the general regulations set forth in section 16-20G.005, and any other applicable regulations, the following regulations shall apply to all rehabilitations, new construction, alterations, and other changes:

- (1) Generally: The following building elements and architectural features shall be considered when applying section 16-20.009 of this chapter to the West End Historic District: doors, windows, foundations, finished floor elevations, roofs, roof features, gutters, downspouts, cornices, siding, porches, steps, terraces, dormers, shutters, awnings, gateways, archways, louvres, walls, fences, and gates.
- (2) Building Façades:
 - (a) All new construction shall conform to the existing building orientation by having sidewalks, front yards, porches and front doors facing and parallel to the street, and if located on a corner, the main façade shall face the principal street whenever possible.
 - (b) At a minimum, the front of all new construction, including any portion thereof, shall be placed at the distance from the street determined by the compatibility rule. This requirement shall also apply to those sides of corner lots which also face a street.
 - (c) All building materials, which upon completion are visible from the public right-of-way, are subject to the compatibility rule.
 - (d) Siding repair or replacement shall match the original in material, scale and direction. For new construction and additions, brick, wood or horizontal smooth cementitious siding is permitted.
- (5) Foundations:
 - (a) Foundation materials, including infill materials, shall replicate the original materials in size, shape, color, texture and mortar, and shall be installed using construction techniques similar to the original.
 - (b) New foundations shall be of masonry or concrete construction. Other foundation materials are permitted provided they are appropriate to the building on which they are located and in scale, materials and style with adjacent and surrounding buildings.
 - (c) Slab on grade is not permitted.
 - (d) Lattice, painted concrete block, brick or stucco shall be used as infill between foundation masonry piers when infill is otherwise required.
- (9) Porches:
 - (a) Architecturally significant porches, including their component features, steps and stoops shall be retained.
 - (b) Replacement porches, steps and stoops shall match the original in size, style and materials. All front porch steps shall have closed risers and ends.
 - (c) Porches may be enclosed with screen wire or glass provided that the main characteristics of a front porch are maintained.
 - (d) New or replacement porches shall contain balustrades, columns and other features consistent with the architectural style of the house or other original porches in that block. The height of the top rail shall be no more than 33 inches above the finish porch floor, except as required by the City's building code.
- (16) Ornaments:
 - (a) Architecturally significant ornaments, such as corner boards, cornices, brackets, downspouts, railings, columns, steps, doors and window moldings, shall be retained.
 - (b) Replacement ornaments shall be permitted only when originals cannot be rehabilitated.
 - (c) Installation of new ornaments, where none previously existed, shall be permitted only when it is in accordance with the architectural style of the original structure.

Remove the asbestos siding and abate any lead paint.

The Staff has no concerns about this component of the project.

If necessary, remove for reinstallation the original siding to complete any structural repairs / replacement to the framing under the original siding.

In general terms, the Staff has no concerns about this component of the project, but would recommend that if the removal of the original siding is necessary, such removal shall be limited to those pieces that are necessary to fully assess and complete the necessary structural repairs.

If necessary, complete structural repairs / replacement of framing.

The Staff has no concerns about this component of the project.

Reinstall original siding and replace in-kind any damaged, missing, or deteriorated pieces.

In general terms, the Staff has no concerns about this component of the project, but would recommend that the damaged, deteriorated, or missing or missing siding be documented to the Staff through detailed, annotated photographs prior to its replacement.

Repaint the house.

The Staff has no concerns about this component of the project.

Replace the non-original front porch railing with a historically compatible railing.

In general terms, the Staff has no concerns about this component of the project, but would recommend that the final design and materials of the proposed front porch railing be submitted to and approved by Staff per the District regulations.

Staff Recommendation: Based upon the following:

- a) With the exceptions noted in the above analysis, the proposal meets the District regulations, per Section 16-20G.006.

Staff recommends approval of the application for Type II Certificate of Appropriateness (CA2-17-214) for alterations at **674 Peoples Street** - Property is zoned R-4A/West End Historic District / Beltline, with the following conditions:

1. If the removal of the original siding is necessary, such removal shall be limited to those pieces that are necessary to fully assess and complete the necessary structural repairs, per Section 16-20G.006(2);
2. The damaged, deteriorated, or missing or missing siding shall be documented to the Staff through detailed, annotated photographs prior to its replacement, per Section 16-20G.006(2);
3. The final design and materials of the proposed front porch railing shall be submitted to and approved by Staff per the District regulations, per Section 16-20G.006(9); and
4. The Staff shall review, and if appropriate approve, the final design documents and supporting materials.



CITY OF ATLANTA

KASIM REED
MAYOR

DEPARTMENT OF CITY PLANNING
55 TRINITY AVENUE, S.W. SUITE 3350 – ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303-0308
404-330-6145 – FAX: 404-658-7491
www.atlantaga.gov

TIM KEANE
Commissioner

OFFICE OF DESIGN

STAFF REPORT May 24, 2017

Agenda Item: Application for a Type III Certificate of Appropriateness (CA3-17-215) for an addition and site work at **2875 Fabin St.** Property is zoned R-4A / Whittier Mill Historic District.

Applicant: Jarrett Thacker
2875 Fabin St.

Facts: This existing single family structure was constructed in 1910 and is considered contributing to the District.

Analysis: The following code sections apply to this application:

Sec. 16-20J.005. - General regulations.

The following regulations shall apply to all properties within the Whittier Mill Historic District:

- (1) *The Compatibility Rule:* The compatibility rule is a method of requiring that alterations and new construction are sensitive and sympathetic to existing elements of design, scale and general character of the district with particular attention to the immediate environment constituting a particular block. In accordance with this purpose, the compatibility rule is as follows: "To the maximum extent possible, the element in question, such as roof form or architectural trim, shall substantially match that which predominates on that block. When elements are quantifiable, such as building height or floor heights, they shall equal the statistical average of all like elements of all structures of like use in that block." Those elements to which the compatibility rule applies are specified in regulations by reference to "compatibility rule."

Sec. 16-20J.006. - Specific regulations—Residential Subarea I.

In addition to the general regulations set forth in section 16-20J.005, and any other applicable regulations, the following regulations shall apply to all properties located within Residential Subarea I:

- (1) *Certificates of Appropriateness:* Certificates of appropriateness within this subarea shall be required as follows:
 - a. *When required:*
 1. To change the exterior appearance of the following elements of a structure within the subarea, when said changes can be seen from the public right-of-way: foundations, siding, chimneys and roofs;
 2. To change the exterior appearance of the following elements of the front façade of a structure: windows, doors, architectural details and porches. For the purpose of this chapter, front façade means the elevation of the building which faces the front yard as defined in Code of Ordinances section 16-28.007(3) and (4).
 3. To erect a new structure; and
 4. To demolish or move any contributing structure, in whole or in part, within the subarea.

- b. *Type required:*
 - 1. Type I certificates of appropriateness for ordinary repairs and maintenance are not required in this subarea. This exemption in no way obviates the requirements for certificates of appropriateness for all minor alterations (Type II), major alterations (Type III) and demolitions (Type IV, except partial demolitions).
 - 2. Except with regard to Type I certificates, the procedures for determining the appropriate type of certificate required under subsection 16-20J.006(1)a. above shall be those specified in section 16-20.008 of the zoning code, provided, however, that a partial demolition shall require a Type IV certificate of appropriateness only when said partial demolition will result in the loss of significant architectural features which destroys the structure's historic interpretability or importance of the front façade.
- (6) *Architectural Standards:*
- a. *Building façades:*
 - 1. All new construction shall conform to the existing building orientation by having porches and front doors facing the front yard.
 - 2. At a minimum, the front of all new construction, including any portion thereof, shall be placed at the distance from the street determined by the compatibility rule.
 - 3. There shall be two (2) side yards, one (1) on each side of the principal building, each having a width of not less than the width of the side yards for the block as established by the compatibility rule.
 - 4. There shall be a rear yard of not less than 10 feet.
 - 5. All building materials which upon completion are visible from the public right-of-way, shall be compatible with those which predominate in the subarea.
 - 6. Siding repair or replacement shall match the original materials in scale and direction. Wood clapboard, if original, is preferred; however, aluminum, masonite, vinyl or other horizontal siding is permitted if window trim, cornerboards, and fascia/bargeboards are left in place or replaced with new material to match the original.
 - 7. No new construction of additions shall exceed the height of the existing structure on the site or, for new construction, that of the tallest structure of like use on the block.
 - b. *Windows and doors:*
 - 1. Architecturally significant windows and doors, including details, trimwork, and framing, shall be retained.
 - 2. Replacement windows and doors shall be permitted only when originals cannot be rehabilitated. Replacement windows and doors shall match the original in design, materials, shape and size with no more than a one-inch width or height difference from the original size.
 - 3. New doors and windows, when permitted, shall be compatible in scale, size, proportion, placement, and design to existing windows and doors.
 - 4. The ratio of openings to solid for all new construction (for example, windows to wall) shall be established by the compatibility rule, with a permitted differential of ten (10) percent.
 - 5. Windows in the front façade of new construction shall be predominantly vertical in proportion and must not be constructed in combination of more than two (2) windows.
 - 6. Replacement exterior doors shall match the original openings and conform to the original door in material and design.
 - 7. New exterior doors shall be wood panel or fixed glass panel in wood frame. In the alternative, metal doors may be used if their design matches that of an original door.
 - c. *Foundations:*
 - 1. Foundations shall be of brick, painted concrete block or stuccoed.
 - 2. Foundations shall be of masonry pier or continuous wall construction closed with solid or screen infill wall.
 - 3. Lattice, painted concrete block, brick or stucco shall be used as infill between foundation masonry piers when infill is otherwise required.
 - 4. Slab on grade is not permitted.
 - f. *Roofs:*
 - 1. Replacement roofs shall match the original roof in material, pitch and shape as well as ridge, overhang and soffit construction.
 - 2. Cold-rolled roofing is permitted only on flat roofs.

3. Corrugated metal and corrugated fiberglass roofs are not permitted.
 4. The shape and pitch of roofs for new construction shall be subject to the compatibility rule.
 5. Dormers shall not be permitted on the roof over the front façade of any structure.
 6. Skylights, solar panels and communication equipment, when otherwise allowed by these or other regulations, are not permitted on the roof over the front façade of any structure.
- g. *Porches:*
6. New decks shall be permitted to the rear of the house.
- j. *Architectural details:*
1. Exterior architectural details, such as brackets, decorative trim, corner boards, windows moldings, railings, columns, steps and doors, which contribute to the character of the buildings and appear on the front façade, shall be retained, restored or replaced to match the original in dimension and design.

The District regulations have both qualitative and quantitative requirements for alterations. If an item is not discussed below, Staff found the related regulations were met.

The Commission only has purview over the portions of the project which can be seen from the public right of way. As such, Staff's discussion of the project will address the front and side façades of the property.

Addition

The proposed addition has a foundation comprised of an unspecified material. Staff recommends the proposed foundation material meet the District regulations.

The District regulations require the building materials which will be visible from the public right of way to be compatible those that predominate in the subarea. In general, Staff finds wood windows predominate the subarea. As such, Staff recommends the proposed windows be wood.

While the District regulations allow for various lap siding products, Staff finds that the use of a smooth faced siding product would be appropriate given the requirement that materials match what predominates in the subarea. As such, Staff recommends the proposed siding material be smooth faced.

CA3-17-215

Staff Recommendations: Based upon the following:

- 1) The plans do not meet the regulations, per Section 16-20J.006;

Staff recommends Application for a Type III Certificate of Appropriateness (CA3-17-215) for an addition and site work at **2875 Fabian St.**, with the following conditions:

1. The proposed foundation material shall meet the District regulations, per Sec. 16-20J.006(6)(c)(1);
2. The proposed windows shall be wood, per Sec. 16-20J.006(a)(5);
3. the proposed siding material be smooth faced, per Sec. 16-20J.006(a)(5); and,
4. Staff shall review and if appropriate, approve the final plans and documentation.



CITY OF ATLANTA

KASIM REED
MAYOR

DEPARTMENT OF CITY PLANNING
55 TRINITY AVENUE, S.W. SUITE 3350 – ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303-0308
404-330-6145 – FAX: 404-658-7491
www.atlantaga.gov

TIM KEANE
Commissioner

OFFICE OF DESIGN

STAFF REPORT May 24, 2017

Agenda Item: Application for a Type II Certificate of Appropriateness (CA2-17-218) for alterations at **477 Glenwood Ave Se**. Property is zoned R-5 / Grant Park Historic District (Subarea 1).

Applicant: Nancy Asiatico
1770 The Exchange

Facts: This existing single family structure was constructed in 1903 and is considered contributing to the District.

Analysis: The following code sections apply to this application:

Sec. 16-20K.006. - General regulations.

The following general regulations shall apply to all properties located within the Grant Park Historic District.

(2) *Certificates of Appropriateness.*

(B) Type II Certificates of Appropriateness shall be required for: Minor alterations to those façades of any contributing principal structure that face public streets; fences; walls; accessory structures; decks; and paving. If the proposed alteration meets the requirements of section 16-20K.007, then the director of the commission shall issue the Type II Certificate. If the proposed alteration does not meet the requirements of section 16-20K.007, the director of the commission shall deny the application. Appeals from said decision of the director regarding the issuance and/or denial of Type II Certificates may be taken by any aggrieved person by filing said appeal in the manner prescribed in the appeals section of Chapter 16-20.008(a) for Type I Certificates.

Sec. 16-20K.007. - Specific regulations: Residential Subarea I.

(1) *Development Controls.*

(B) *Side Yards:* Side yards shall either: i) conform to the setback of the previously existing contributing building of like use; ii) conform to the setback of the existing building; iii) conform to any existing pattern of unequal side yard setbacks previously established by a majority of the contributing buildings of like use on that side of the block; or iv) be of a width of not less than seven feet.

(C) *Rear Yard:* Rear yard setback shall be seven feet.

(2) *Architectural Standards.*

(B) *Design Standards and Criteria for New Principal Structures.*
cted.

6. The height of the principal structure shall not exceed 35 feet. (See section 16-28.022 for excluded portions of structures.)

7. The first floor of the principal structure shall be on foundations and elevated above the grade a minimum of two entrance step risers each of which shall be no less than six inches in height. All front steps shall have closed risers and closed ends. Access ramps shall be permitted.

9. Decks, Balconies and Upper Level Terraces:
 - a. Decks shall be permitted only when located to the rear of the principal structure.
 - b. Decks shall be permitted at any level.
 - c. Balconies and upper level terraces shall be permitted.
11. Any façades that face a public street shall consist of fenestration that is either: 1) substantially consistent with fenestration on contributing structures of like use in the district, or 2) shall be no less than 15 percent and no greater than 40 percent of the total surface wall area. Windows may be individual or grouped. No individual window unit shall exceed 28 square feet. Within each individual window unit, no individual window sash, either fixed or operable, shall exceed 16 square feet.
15. On those façades of any structure that face a public street, the following regulations on building materials shall apply. Alternate materials may be submitted for review by the commission.
 - a. Paving materials for walks and drives: Black asphalt is prohibited.
 - b. Visible foundation materials: Foundations shall constitute a distinct building design element and shall contrast with the front façade siding material. Brick, stone, concrete, stucco, and architectural concrete masonry units (C.M.U.) shall be permitted. Standard, unfinished concrete block and stacked stone is prohibited.
 - c. Siding/veneer: Horizontal lap siding, vinyl siding, aluminum siding, shingles, brick, hard stucco, and stone shall be permitted. Stacked stone is prohibited.
 - d. Roofing: Asphalt shingles, wood shingles, metal shingles, slate, and pre-finished metal panels shall be permitted.
 - e. Chimneys: Brick, stone, or architectural concrete masonry units (C.M.U.) shall be permitted. Siding is prohibited.
 - f. Fences: Brick, stone, wire mesh, architectural C.M.U., or vertical pickets made of ornamental metal, wood or simulated wood shall be permitted in the front yard and half depth front yard.
- (D) *Design Criteria for Alterations and Additions to Contributing Structures.* Alterations and additions to contributing structures requiring a Certificate of Appropriateness shall comply with one of the following provided that the mere increase in floor area otherwise authorized in the district shall not constitute a standard for review:
 1. Alterations and additions shall be consistent with and reinforce the historic architectural character of the entire existing contributing structure and shall comply with the applicable regulations for new construction set forth in subsection 16-20K.007(2)(B) above; or
 2. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work may differentiate from the old. To protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment, any new work will be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features of the property and environment.

The District regulations allow for two criteria for reviewing alterations to contributing structures. As the project involves the removal of the existing front façade windows which could be original to the structure, Staff will use the first criterion to review the proposed work.

As the Commission only has purview over façades facing the public street, Staff will address changes to the front façade of the structure only. If an item is not discussed below, Staff found the related regulations were met.

Rear addition

The proposed project involves a rear addition which is outside of the Commission's purview. Staff has reviewed the addition and found that it meets the quantitative requirements prescribed by the R-5 zoning and the District regulations.

Alterations

The District regulations require decks to be located to the rear of the structure. The proposed deck would extend past the rear corner of the addition and project out from the side façade. Staff finds this configuration is not allowed by the District regulations. As such, Staff recommends the deck be placed to the rear of the addition and not extend past the side façade structure.

CA3-17-218

Staff Recommendations: Based upon the following:

- 1) The plans meet the regulations, per Section 16-20K.007;

Staff recommends Approval of an Application for a Type II Certificate of Appropriateness (CA2-17-218) for alterations at **477 Glenwood Ave.** with the following conditions:

1. The deck shall be placed to the rear of the addition and shall not extend past the side façade of the structure, per Sec. 16-20K.007(2)(b)(9)(a); and,
2. Staff shall review and if appropriate approve the final plans and documentation.



CITY OF ATLANTA

KASIM REED
MAYOR

DEPARTMENT OF CITY PLANNING
55 TRINITY AVENUE, S.W. SUITE 3350 – ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303-0308
404-330-6145 – FAX: 404-658-7491
www.atlantaga.gov

TIM KEANE
Commissioner

OFFICE OF DESIGN

STAFF REPORT May 24, 2017

Agenda Item: Application for a Type II Certificate of Appropriateness (CA2-17-220) for alterations at **484 Broyles St.** Property is zoned R-5 / Grant Park Historic District (Subarea 1).

Applicant: Alice Johnson
1403 Emory Rd.

Facts: This existing single family structure was constructed in 1913 and is considered contributing to the District.

Analysis: The following code sections apply to this application:

Sec. 16-20K.006. - General regulations.

The following general regulations shall apply to all properties located within the Grant Park Historic District.

(2) *Certificates of Appropriateness.*

(C) Type III Certificates of Appropriateness shall be required for:

2. All major alterations and additions to existing structure, with respect to any façade that faces a public street.

(2) *Architectural Standards.*

(B) *Design Standards and Criteria for New Principal Structures.*

1. Identified design elements of size, scale, massing and materials of new construction shall be substantially consistent with said identified design elements found in contributing structures of like use in the district as listed in subsection 16-20K.007(15)(c).
3. Front porches on the principal structure shall be required and shall be a minimum of one-third the width of the front façade and a minimum of seven feet in depth. Side porches shall be a minimum of four feet in depth. Porches may be enclosed by screen wire only, provided all the main features of a porch are maintained in place and the screening materials can be removed at a future date with minimal damage to said features.
4. All front façades and front porches of the principal structure shall face and be parallel to the lot frontage. Wrap around front porches are permitted.
7. The first floor of the principal structure shall be on foundations and elevated above the grade a minimum of two entrance step risers each of which shall be no less than six inches in height. All front steps shall have closed risers and closed ends. Access ramps shall be permitted.
15. On those façades of any structure that face a public street, the following regulations on building materials shall apply. Alternate materials may be submitted for review by the commission.
 - a. Paving materials for walks and drives: Black asphalt is prohibited.
 - b. Visible foundation materials: Foundations shall constitute a distinct building design element and shall contrast with the front façade siding material. Brick, stone, concrete, stucco, and

- architectural concrete masonry units (C.M.U.) shall be permitted. Standard, unfinished concrete block and stacked stone is prohibited.
- c. Siding/veneer: Horizontal lap siding, vinyl siding, aluminum siding, shingles, brick, hard stucco, and stone shall be permitted. Stacked stone is prohibited.
 - d. Roofing: Asphalt shingles, wood shingles, metal shingles, slate, and pre-finished metal panels shall be permitted.
 - e. Chimneys: Brick, stone, or architectural concrete masonry units (C.M.U.) shall be permitted. Siding is prohibited.
 - f. Fences: Brick, stone, wire mesh, architectural C.M.U., or vertical pickets made of ornamental metal, wood or simulated wood shall be permitted in the front yard and half depth front yard.
- (D) *Design Criteria for Alterations and Additions to Contributing Structures.* Alterations and additions to contributing structures requiring a Certificate of Appropriateness shall comply with one of the following provided that the mere increase in floor area otherwise authorized in the district shall not constitute a standard for review:
1. Alterations and additions shall be consistent with and reinforce the historic architectural character of the entire existing contributing structure and shall comply with the applicable regulations for new construction set forth in subsection 16-20K.007(2)(B) above; or
 2. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work may differentiate from the old. To protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment, any new work will be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features of the property and environment.

The District regulations allow for two criteria when reviewing alterations to a contributing structure. The first states that additions shall be consistent with and reinforce the historic architectural character of the entire existing contributing structure and shall comply with the applicable regulations for new construction. The second states that the addition shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property, that the new work may differentiate from the old, and any new work be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features of the property and environment. As it is not clear whether the railing and steps in question are original to the house and whether any historic material will be destroyed in this project, Staff will use the first of the two criteria to review the alterations.

The Applicant is proposing the replacement of the existing front steps and rail, along with in-kind repairs to the floorboards, railing, and ceiling. In general, Staff finds the methods prescribed by the Applicant to be appropriate and has no concerns with the design of the project.

CA3-17-220

Staff Recommendations: Based upon the following:

- 1) The plans meet the regulations, per Section 16-20K.007;

Staff recommends Approval of an Application for a Type II Certificate of Appropriateness (CA2-17-220) for alterations at **484 Broyles St**



CITY OF ATLANTA

KASIM REED
MAYOR

DEPARTMENT OF CITY PLANNING
55 TRINITY AVENUE, S.W. SUITE 3350 – ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303-0308
404-330-6145 – FAX: 404-658-7491
www.atlantaga.gov

TIM KEANE
Commissioner

OFFICE OF DESIGN

STAFF REPORT May 24, 2017

Agenda Item: Application for a Type III Certificate of Appropriateness (CA3-17-221) for dormer additions at **474 Hill Street** - Property is zoned R-5 / Grant Park Historic District (Subarea 1) / Beltline.

Applicant: Heather Shuster
124 South Columbia Drive, Decatur

Facts: The existing house was built in 2004 and consists of a two-story, “Queen Anne” form with a high hipped gable, two-story front porch set within the ell of the gabled ell form. The projecting ell has a front facing accent gable. At this time, the Applicant is proposing to add two side facing dormers to allow the creation of a usable third floor, which is now currently attic space. These dormers are located on the side roof planes of the hipped roof, but engage the front roof plane and thus affect a façade of the house that faces a public street. Otherwise, alterations to the side or rear facades of the house are not subject to review by the Commission or the Staff as they don’t affect a façade that faces a public street. Apart from the proposed roof dormers, no other work is proposed on a façade that faces a public street. The only other exterior change is on the right side façade.

Analysis: The following code sections apply to this application:

Per Section 16-20K.006 of the Atlanta Land Development Code, as amended:

The following general regulations shall apply to all properties located within the Grant Park Historic District.

(1) General Criteria.

- a. Notwithstanding any other provision herein, no Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required unless, at a minimum, the work would otherwise require a building permit.
- b. Except as otherwise provided herein, the procedures for determining the appropriate type of certificate shall be those specified in section 16-20.008 of the zoning code.
- c. In Residential Subarea I, the commission shall apply the standards referenced in 16.20.009 only if the standards set forth in this Chapter 20K do not specifically address the application.

(2) Certificates of Appropriateness.

- c. Type III Certificates of Appropriateness shall be required for:
 2. All major alterations and additions to existing structure, with respect to any façade that faces a public street.

Section 16-20K.007. Specific Regulations - Residential Subarea I

(1) Development Controls.

- a. Front Yards: Front yard setbacks shall either: i) conform to the setback of the previously existing contributing building of like use; or ii) shall be no closer to the street than the closest and no farther from the street than the farthest contributing structure of like use on that side of the block.
- b. Side Yards: Side yards shall either: i) conform to the setback of the previously existing contributing building of like use; ii) conform to the setback of the existing building; iii) conform to any existing pattern of unequal side yard setbacks previously established by a majority of the contributing buildings of like use on that side of the block; or iv) be of a width of not less than seven (7) feet.

- c. Rear Yard: Rear yard setback shall be seven feet.
- (2) Architectural Standards.
- B. Design Standards and Criteria for New Principal Structures.
 - 1. Identified design elements of size, scale, massing and materials of new construction shall be substantially consistent with said identified design elements found in contributing structures of like use in the district as listed in subsection 16-20K.007(15)(c).
 - 5. Roof form above the front façade of the principal structure shall be gabled and/or hipped. Roof pitch shall be a minimum of 6 in 12. Roof pitch above porches shall not be restricted.
 - 15. On those façades of any structure that face a public street, the following regulations on building materials shall apply. Alternate materials may be submitted for review by the commission.
 - b. Visible foundation materials: Foundations shall constitute a distinct building design element and shall contrast with the front façade siding material. Brick, stone, concrete, stucco, and architectural concrete masonry units (C.M.U.) shall be permitted. Standard, unfinished concrete block and stacked stone is prohibited.
 - c. Siding/veneer: Horizontal lap siding, vinyl siding, aluminum siding, shingles, brick, hard stucco, and stone shall be permitted. Stacked stone is prohibited.
 - d. Roofing: Asphalt shingles, wood shingles, metal shingles, slate, and pre-finished metal panels shall be permitted.
 - C. Design Standards and Criteria for Alterations and Additions to Non-contributing Structures. Alterations to non-contributing structures, for which a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required, shall be consistent with and reinforce the architectural character of the existing structure or shall comply with the applicable regulations for new construction set forth in subsection 16-20K.007(2)(B) above.

General Development Controls

Given the proposed scope of work, the proposed lot coverage should be the same as the existing lot coverage and thus meet the zoning regulations. No information was included about the floor area ratio which would be increasing due to the creation of a true third floor. The Staff would recommend the Applicant provide floor area ratio calculations and the proposed project meet the floor ratio requirements of the underlying zoning.

Given the proposed dormers are located on the existing roof and in line or setback from the existing front, sides, and rear of the existing house, all of the setback requirements have been met.

General Design Review

Given the current form and style of the house, the Staff finds that the proposed dormer addition is consistent with and reinforces the architectural character of the existing structure. Dormers in various sizes (with and without small, side knee walls) are common on “Queen Anne” style and form houses, which typically have more complex roof lines with higher pitches roofs. The proposed asphalt shingles are the same roofing material as exists on the house now. The gable finishes and architectural elements are not subject to review by the Commission as they face the sides.

Further, the proposed changes comply with the new construction requirements that apply to changes in roof form, pitch, and shape.

Staff Recommendation: Based upon the following:

- 1. Except as noted above, the proposal meets the District regulations, per Section 16-20K.006 and 16-20K.007.

Staff recommends approval of an application for a Type III Certificate of Appropriateness (CA3-17-221) for dormer additions at **474 Hill Street** - Property is zoned R-5 / Grant Park Historic District (Subarea 1) / Beltline, with the following conditions:

- 1. The Applicant shall floor area ratio calculations and the proposed project meet the floor ratio requirements of the underlying zoning, per Section 16-20K.007(2)(C); and
- 2. The Staff shall review, and if appropriate, approve, the final plans and supporting documentation.



CITY OF ATLANTA

KASIM REED
MAYOR

DEPARTMENT OF CITY PLANNING
55 TRINITY AVENUE, S.W. SUITE 3350 – ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303-0308
404-330-6145 – FAX: 404-658-7491
www.atlantaga.gov

TIM KEANE
Commissioner
OFFICE OF DESIGN

STAFF REPORT May 24, 2017

Agenda Item: Application for Type III Certificates of Appropriateness (CA3-17-224) for a porch addition at **58 Howell Street** - Property is zoned Martin Luther King, Jr. Landmark District (Subarea 2)/Beltline.

Applicant: Dita Broz
58 Howell Street

Facts: The property is located on the northwest corner of Howell Street and Old Wheat Street. A contemporary structure, it is not contributing to the District.

The Applicant is proposing to:

1. Remove a rear deck, including its foundation posts;
2. Build a rear screened porch / deck with the deck extending past the Old Wheat Street side of the house) and a set of stairs off that deck down to the back / side yard.

Analysis: The following code sections apply to this application:

Sec. 16-20C.004. General regulations

The following general regulations shall apply to all properties within the Martin Luther King, Jr. Landmark District, except where otherwise stated.

1. General criteria. The Commission shall apply the standards set forth below only when the standards set forth elsewhere in Chapter 20C do not specifically address the application in whole or in part:
 - a. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use authorized in Section 16-20C.005 using minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
 - b. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
 - c. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
 - d. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
 - e. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.
 - f. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
 - g. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

- h. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
 - i. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
 - j. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.
2. The compatibility rule.
- a. Block definitions. The following words and terms, when used in this chapter, shall have the meanings ascribed to them in this section:
 - i. Block. An area of land located within a continuous perimeter of public streets. An individual block shall begin at the back edge of curb of the adjacent street. Interstate 75/85, when no intervening street exists, shall be permitted to count as an adjacent street for purposes of meeting this definition, beginning at the edge of the adjacent 75/85 right-of-way.
 - ii. Block face. One side of a block, located between two consecutive street intersections.
 - b. The intent of these regulations is to ensure that alterations to existing structures and new construction are compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of each Subarea and of the immediately adjacent environment of a particular block or block face. To further that intent and simultaneously retain flexibility, the regulations provide a "compatibility rule" which is: The element in question, such as roof form or architectural trim, shall match that which predominates:
 - i. On contributing buildings of like use along the same block face in Subareas 1 and 2.
 - c. Where quantifiable, such as building height or floor height, the element shall be no smaller than the smallest or larger than the largest such dimension of the contributing building(s) along the same block face in Subareas 1 and 2 and on individual blocks in Subareas 3 and 4.
 - d. Those elements to which the compatibility rule applies are specified in these regulations by reference to "compatibility rule."
 - e. Building height shall be measured on the front elevation from the average point of grade on the front elevation to the highest point of the roof or façade, whichever is higher.
3. Certificates of Appropriateness.
- a. General Provisions.
 - i. The procedures for determining the correct type of Certificate of Appropriateness shall be those specified in Section 16-20.008, except as otherwise provided herein.
 - ii. No certificate of appropriateness shall be required unless, at a minimum, the work would otherwise require a building permit.
 - c. Type III Certificates of Appropriateness. The following Type III Certificates of Appropriateness shall be reviewed by the Commission and shall be required for:
 - ii. Additions;
10. Time period of historical significance. Where referenced in this chapter, the time period of historical significance for the district shall be the lifetime of Martin Luther King, Jr. (1929-1968).

Sec. 16-20C.005. Permitted Principal Uses and Structures.

1. Permitted Principal Uses and Structures: The following permitted uses and restrictions apply to all Subareas within this District, except Subarea 5:
- a. The permitted principal uses and special permit uses set forth in Table 1: Martin Luther King Jr. Landmark District Table of Uses shall be permitted only as listed within each Subarea within said table of uses and only in the manner so listed.
 - b. Permitted principal uses. A building or premises shall be used only for the principal uses indicated with a "P" in Table 1: Martin Luther King Jr. Landmark District Table of Uses, subject to further restrictions where noted.

TABLE 1: MARTIN LUTHER KING JR. LANDMARK DISTRICT TABLE OF USES	SUBAREA 1 Auburn Ave Res	SUBAREA 2 Residential	SUBAREA 3 Institutional	SUBAREA 4 Auburn/Edgewood Commercial
RESIDENTIAL and DWELLING USES				
Single-family dwellings	P	P	P	P

Sec. 16-20C.006. Lot Controls and Building Heights.

1. The following Lot Controls and building heights provisions shall apply to Subareas 1 and 2.
- a. Lot controls.
 - i. The compatibility rule shall apply for the purposes of determining permitted lot coverage.

- b. Building heights.
 - iii. For all other areas, the height of any alteration, addition, or new construction shall be established through the compatibility rule.-

Sec. 16-20C.007. Sidewalks, Yards and Open Space.

- 1. The following Sidewalks, Yards and Open Spaces provisions shall apply to Subareas 1 through 4.
 - b. Yards. Notwithstanding the setback requirements of these Subareas, previously existing contributing structures may be reconstructed to their original footprints and setbacks upon a submittal of finding that such structural dimensions have been shown by archived evidence or sworn affidavit(s) to have previously existed on the proposed site, and as subsequently approved by the Commission.
 - c. Required Open Space.
 - i. Open Space shall be required only for multi-family uses. All other uses shall have no Open Space requirements.
- 2. The following additional Yards provisions shall apply to Subareas 1 and 2.
 - b. Subarea 2.
 - i. Except as provided below, all front, side and rear yard setbacks shall be established through utilization of the compatibility rule. All new construction shall maintain a minimum of 10 feet for rear yard setbacks where the compatibility rule would permit a smaller rear yard setback, except as otherwise provided for accessory structures.

Sec. 16-20C.008. Design Standards.

- 1. The following Design Standards provisions shall apply to Subareas 1 through 4.
 - a. Building Compatibility.
 - i. All elements of new construction shall be utilized in a meaningful, coherent manner, rather than a mere aggregation of random historic elements.
 - ii. The compatibility rule shall apply to a principal structure's general façade organization, proportion, scale, roof form, pitch and materials, door and window placement, and other architectural details including but not limited to brackets, decorative trim, corner boards, bottom boards, fascia boards, columns, steps and attic vents.
 - iii. Fiberglass roofs shall be prohibited.
 - b. Fenestration.
 - c. Landscaping.
 - d. Loading Areas, Loading Dock Entrances, and Building Mechanical and Accessory Features for All Non-Residential Uses.
- 2. The following Design Standards provisions shall apply to Subareas 1 through 2.
 - a. Windows and Doors.
 - b. Front Yard Porches.
 - i. Front yard porches shall be provided.
 - ii. Front yard porches shall contain balustrades, columns, floor dimensions, height, roof pitch and overhangs as regulated by the compatibility rule.
 - iii. Decorative metal, resin, fiberglass and plastic columns are prohibited.
 - iv. Front yard porches are permitted to be enclosed with recessed screen wire when the primary characteristics of the porch are maintained.
 - v. Front yard porch steps shall be wood, brick or concrete. Metal steps are prohibited.
 - vi. A paved walkway from the front yard porch to the adjacent public sidewalk shall be required.
 - c. Siding and Foundations.

Remove a rear deck, including its foundation posts.

The Staff has no concerns about this component of the project.

Build a rear screened porch / deck with the deck extending past the Old Wheat Street side of the house) and a set of stairs off that deck down to the back / side yard.

The proposed rear porch and deck are subject to the compatibility rule regarding the resulting lot coverage and setbacks. The proposed lot coverage is noted on the site plan (44.8%), but the range of lot coverages of the historic houses on the block face. The Staff would recommend the Applicant document the lot coverage range per the compatibility rule and that the proposed lot coverage is within that range.

Similarly, the rear yard setback is getting smaller with the proposed project. While the rear yard setback is noted on the site plan, no compatibility rule information was included for this setback based on the

historic houses on the block face. The Staff would recommend the Applicant document the rear yard setback range per the compatibility rule and that the proposed rear yard setback is within that range.

Similarly, the half-depth front yard setback (the Old Wheat Street setback) is getting smaller with the proposed project. While the half-depth front yard setback can be measured on the site plan, no compatibility rule information was included for those setbacks based on the historic houses on the block face with this half-depth front yard. This Old Wheat Street setback needs to be compared against similar setbacks – that is, other corner lot setbacks. For this particular lot, the comparable setbacks would be the Old Wheat Street setback of the house on the southwest corner of the intersection (54 Howell Street) and southeastern corner (540 Auburn Avenue). The proposed setback would have to be within the distance range established by those two houses. The Staff would recommend the Applicant document the half-depth yard setback per the compatibility rule and that the proposed half-depth yard setback is within that range.

As for the design of the rear porch / deck itself, the Staff is concerned about the deck portion of the project, given its high visibility from Old Wheat Street and that decks are a contemporary and sometimes not compatible element. While there are some decks at are visible from public street, the Staff is not aware of any that are as highly visible from the cross street of a corner lot as this one would be. Further, the Staff understands that this is already a non-contributing house to the District (i.e. a newer house), but nonetheless would recommend that the deck portion of the project either be converted to a porch, be moved to the opposite side of the proposed rear porch (i.e. the interior side yard), or be eliminated from the proposed design.

Staff Recommendations: Based upon the following:

- a) The plans meet the regulations, with the exceptions noted in the above analysis, per Section 16-20C.004 – 16-20C.008.

Staff recommends approval of the application for a Type III Certificates of Appropriateness (CA3-16-550) for a porch addition at **58 Howell Street** - Property is zoned Martin Luther King, Jr. Landmark District (Subarea 2)/Beltline, with the following conditions:

1. The Applicant shall document the lot coverage range per the compatibility rule and that the proposed lot coverage shall be within that range, per Section 16-20C.006(1)(a);
2. The Applicant shall document the rear yard setback range per the compatibility rule and that the proposed rear yard setback shall be within that range, per Section 16-20C.007(1)(b);
3. The Applicant shall document the half-depth yard setback per the compatibility rule and that the proposed half-depth yard setback shall be within that range, per Section 16-20C.007(1)(b);
4. The deck portion of the project shall either be converted to a porch, be moved to the opposite side of the proposed rear porch (i.e. the interior side yard), or be eliminated from the proposed design, per Section 16-20C.004(1) and .008(1); and
5. The Staff shall review, and if appropriate, approve the final plans and supporting documentation.



CITY OF ATLANTA

KASIM REED
MAYOR

DEPARTMENT OF CITY PLANNING
55 TRINITY AVENUE, S.W. SUITE 3350 – ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303-0308
404-330-6145 – FAX: 404-658-7491
www.atlantaga.gov

TIM KEANE
Commissioner

OFFICE OF DESIGN

STAFF REPORT

May 24, 2017

Agenda Item: Review and Comment (RC-17-239) for In-Rem demolition applications from April, 2017 at various addresses – Properties are zoned variously.

Applicant: Daphne Talley – Atlanta Police Department, Code Enforcement
818 Pollard Drive

Facts: The subject properties were recommended for demolition by the City of Atlanta’s In Rem Review Board at its April, 2017 meeting. The 5 properties are located across the City in both National Register of Historic Places-eligible and National Register listed neighborhoods. All but one is a single-family or duplex house (the remaining property consists of an apartment complex).

Through the Administration In Rem proceeding set forth in Article III, Section 30 of the Atlanta Housing Code, the Atlanta Police Department-Code Enforcement Section can proceed with demolition or clean and close action against private property. When a property owner fails to bring his/her property into compliance with the Atlanta Housing Code or the Atlanta Commercial Institutional Building Maintenance Code, a review/inspection of such property is conducted by the Code Enforcement staff to determine if the property (structure) is eligible for demolition or clean and close abatement.

Generally, properties that are unsecured, fire damaged, collapsing, or severely dilapidated are eligible for In Rem proceedings. However, the Atlanta Housing Code states any property (structure) that cannot be repaired at cost less than 50% of the value (exclusive of foundation and lot) it can be demolished. If the structure can be repaired at less than 50% of the value (exclusive of foundations and lot) it can be cleaned and closed.

Once the inspection assessment (determination of demolition or clean and close) of such properties is completed, an In Rem hearing is scheduled and evidence is put forth before the In Rem Review Board. Evidence includes, but not limited to, the number of complaints filed with the APD-Code Enforcement Section, the types of violations noted, the progression of notification to property owner(s), photographs, and the inspection assessment.

When an Order of demolition or clean and close is issued by the In Rem Review Board, the APD-Code Enforcement Section has authorization to access that private property and abate the nuisance. Once the abatement is completed, a lien is filed against the property for the cost of the abatement.

Analysis: The following code sections apply to this application.

Per Section 6-4043 of the Atlanta City Code:

- (7) The commission shall review the alteration, demolition, movement or construction of any structure, site or building which involves the use of capital expenditures by the City of Atlanta or capital expenditures by other public agencies or authorities which are required to submit plans for review by the city.

While the Staff is always concerned about the loss of historic or potentially historic buildings in the City of Atlanta, the properties in the In Rem review process are either in very poor condition, the City is unable to find the legitimate property owner, or the property owner cannot or will not address the situation. Further, the properties have often been in the City of Atlanta's code compliance system for some time meaning that there are been additional opportunities at which the property was made aware of the problems and given an opportunity to address the situation.

Regardless, the Staff finds that given the volume of properties proposed for demolition, digital images of a representative sample of the properties in the best condition should be prepared and retained by the Code Enforcement Section of the Atlanta Police Department and the Office of Design's historic preservation staff.

Based on the information provided to date by the Code Enforcement Staff, the Staff would suggest the following properties have digital images prepared and retained by the Code Enforcement Staff:

1529 Carlisle Street, NW

Staff Recommendation: The Staff recommends that the Commission deliver comments at the meeting regarding Review and Comment (RC-17-239) for In-Rem demolition applications from April, 2017 at various addresses – Properties are zoned variously.



CITY OF ATLANTA

KASIM REED
MAYOR

DEPARTMENT OF CITY PLANNING
55 TRINITY AVENUE, S.W. SUITE 3350 – ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303-0308
404-330-6145 – FAX: 404-658-7491
www.atlantaga.gov

TIME KEANE
Commissioner

OFFICE OF DESIGN

STAFF REPORT

May 24, 2017

Agenda Item: Review and comment (RC-17247) for new construction and site work at **2890 North Fulton Drive (Atlanta International School)** - Property is zoned R-4.

Applicant: Paula Saeger, Atlanta International School
2890 North Fulton Drive, NE

Facts: Atlanta International School is a private school that leases its property from the Atlanta Public School system. As such, construction work at the property is subject to the Commission Review and Comment process for public agency related work.

Before the Commission as this time is the construction of a new building in the southeastern portion of the campus, in front of the existing primary school building, library and secondary school building. The secondary school building is the former, historic North Atlanta High School Building and is the most prominent building on the campus. The new construction will remove an existing, contemporary playground and will include a new outdoor learning space and a glass entry pavilion on the northeast corner of the new building connecting it to the 1970s library building. The new construction will not be attached to the historic school building.

Per Section 6-4043 of the Atlanta City Code:

- (5) The Commission shall review the proposed location and design of buildings, bridges, viaducts, elevated ways, streets, highways, gates, fences, railings, lamp standards, and other structures or fixtures to be erected or placed on land belonging to the city, or on any private or public property which extends over or upon any property or right-of-way owned or controlled by the city.
- (6) The commission shall review the alteration, demolition, movement or construction of any structure, site or building which involves the use of capital expenditures by the City of Atlanta or capital expenditures by other public agencies or authorities which are required to submit plans for review by the city.

Per Section 16-20.009. Same; further standards.

- (1) Every reasonable effort shall be made to adapt the property in a manner which requires minimal alteration of the building, structure or site and its environment.

- (5) Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should reflect the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historical, physical, or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures.
- (6) Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural or cultural material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property, neighborhood or environment.
- (7) Whenever possible, new additions or alterations to buildings, structures or sites shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building, structure or site would be unimpaired.

The Staff finds that the proposed new construction respects the historic school's building architecture by utilizing some of the architectural elements, proportions and materials of the historic building, but in a more simplified manner. Further, the proposed building would not appear to be significantly taller than the historic building even without taking into account the dome and cupola of the historic building. Given the mixed architectural themes of the buildings on the campus (including the 1970s gym and an even later primary school building), the Staff finds that using a simplified version of the historic building is the best thematic route to undertake. The Staff would note that the use of the glass enclosure to create a visual break between the new construction and the library building to which it is attached is not as critical then if the new construction had been attached to the historic building. The Staff also appreciates the efficient use of this portion of the property such that little is any "left over"; minimally useful space is created between or around the buildings.

At the same time, the Staff is somewhat concerned that the new construction will be forward of the historic building (i.e. closer to North Fulton Drive) which would increase its visual prominence of the site. As a mitigating factor, though, the Staff appreciates that this location would not reconfigure the open lawn / parking area in front of the school and would to some degree balance the overall site configuration by closing the southern end of the open space similar to the building that is forward of the historic school at the northern end of the open space.

Staff Recommendation: The Staff recommends that the Commission confirm that it has delivered its comments to the Applicant at the Commission meeting regarding an application for Review and comment (RC-17-247) for new construction and site work at **2890 North Fulton Drive (Atlanta International School)** - Property is zoned R-4.